

Item No. 2	Classification: OPEN	Date: 2 June 2010	Meeting Name: Walworth Community Council
Report title:	Development Management planning application: Application 10-AP-0419 for: Listed Building Consent Address: CAMBRIDGE HOUSE, 131-139 CAMBERWELL ROAD LONDON, SE5 7JZ Proposal: Extensions at ground and first floor level to rear of terraced Grade II listed buildings fronting Camberwell Rd, and extensions and alterations to the rear of the site including installation of lift to No. 133, construction of stairs and addition of single storey glazed link to the rear at ground floor level to No. 135, extension of rear extension at second floor level to No. 137, and erection of single storey rear extension at ground floor level along full length of boundary at No. 139. Scheme also includes alterations to the Addington Square buildings and frontage, including two storey glazed entrance foyer to the rear of the Addington Square entrance, installation of mezzanine floor and external alterations to the Gilroy Hall fronting Addington Square, external alterations to Addington Square elevations, and part one/part two storey extension to the rear of Gilroy Hall. In addition, erection of part two, part single storey extensions for office accommodation at the rear of the site.		
Ward(s) or groups affected:	Camberwell Green		
From:	Head of Development Management		
Application Start Date 26/02/2010		Application Expiry Date 23/04/2010	

RECOMMENDATION

- 1 Grant listed building consent subject to any direction by the Secretary of State, as the application has received an objection from one of the statutory amenity societies

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Site location and description

- 2 Refer to accompanying report on application for full planning permission LBS Reg 10AP0415.

Details of proposal

- 3 Refer to accompanying report on application for full planning permission LBS Reg 10AP0415.

Planning history

None relevant.

Planning history of adjoining sites

4 None relevant.

KEY ISSUES FOR CONSIDERATION

Summary of main issues

5 The main issues to be considered in respect of this application are:

a) the principle of the development in terms of land use and conformity with strategic policies.

b] the impact on the fabric of the Grade II listed buildings and the setting of the listed building and its listed neighbour to the south

Planning policy

6 Southwark Plan 2007 (July)

SP 13 Design and heritage

3.15 Conservation of the historic environment

3.17 Listed buildings

3.18 Setting of listed buildings, conservation areas and world heritage sites

London Plan 2008 consolidated with alterations since 2004

7 4B.11 London's built heritage

Planning Policy Guidance (PPG) and Planning Policy Statements (PPS)

PPS5 Planning and the historic environment

Principle of development

8 The development would be acceptable subject to an assessment of the effect of the proposal on the features of special architectural or historic interest. These matters are addressed below.

Environmental impact assessment

9 n Environmental Statement is not required with this application as the development does not fall within Schedule 1 of the Town and Country Planning (Environmental Impact Assessment) Regulations 1999. The scheme can be considered to fall within Schedule 2, being an 'urban development project'. A Screening Opinion was not requested prior to the submission of the application as the site does not exceed 0.5ha (being 0.1564ha). In addition, it has been considered that the development is unlikely to have a significant effect upon the environment by reason of its nature, size or location based upon a review of the Schedule 3 selection criteria for screening Schedule 2 Development. The site has an established community use and is located outside of a sensitive area as per Regulation 2(1) and the development is unlikely to generate any significant environmental effects. Therefore an Environmental Impact Assessment is not required.

Impact of proposed development on amenity of adjoining occupiers and surrounding area

10 Not relevant to listed building consent.

Impact of adjoining and nearby uses on occupiers and users of proposed development

11 Not relevant to listed building consent.

Traffic issues

12 Not relevant to listed building consent.

Design issues

- 13 See below.
- Impact on character and setting of a listed building and/or conservation area**
- 14 Policy 3.17 states that planning permission for proposals which involve an alteration or extension to a listed building will only be permitted where:
- i. There is no loss of important historic fabric; and
 - ii. The development is not detrimental to the special architectural or historic interest of the building; and
 - iii. The development relates sensitively and respects the period, style, detailing and context of the listed building or later alterations of architectural or historic interest; and
 - iv. Existing detailing and important later additional features of the building are preserved, repaired or, if missing, replaced.
- 15 The proposed works to the listed building are substantial. They include the relocation of the front entrance, the removal and modification of a number of internal partitions, the removal of a number of staircases – principally that in 135 Camberwell Road – and the insertion of a new lift in 133 Camberwell Road. Finally, the proposals also include the landscaping of the front gardens to reinstatement of the original lawned gardens. We are advised in PPS 5 – Planning for the Historic Environment (Policy HE 9.1) that: *‘there should be a presumption in favour of conservation of designated heritage assets.’* and that the heritage asset’s *‘significance can be harmed or lost through alteration or destruction of the heritage asset or development within its setting.’* Furthermore, that: *‘Loss affecting any designated heritage asset should require clear and convincing justification.’* PPS 5 – Planning for the Historic Environment; Historic Environment Planning Practice Guide (March 2010 – paragraph 182) states that: *‘The plan form of a building is frequently one of its most important characteristics and internal partitions, staircases (whether decorated or plain, principal or secondary) and other features are likely to form part of its significance.’*
- 16 The relocation of the main entrance, to be moved from the central bay of number 131 Camberwell Road to its original location in the low building to the flank to match the existing listed building across Arlington Square is supported and will enhance the public’s appreciation of, not just 131 Camberwell Road but also this group of buildings as a whole. A condition should be imposed requiring a method statement for this work as well as detailed drawings of the relocated door and windows to ensure that the historical and architectural significance of the listed building is preserved.
- 17 In relation to the walls and the plan form of these nationally important buildings the material submitted with the application illustrates that this group of listed buildings have already been laterally converted. This has meant that openings are already in place which link across the adjacent houses at different levels and more recent partitions inserted that have resulted in a rabbit-warren of spaces, corridors and rooms that have affected the public’s appreciation of these fine buildings. When we compare the existing and proposed plan layouts we are able to ascertain that the proposal seeks to remove non-original partitions and retain the original 1804 dividing wall line within the houses to ensure that the natural order of the original plan form is restored and can be appreciated whilst retaining the lateral conversion. Openings are inserted in certain areas to facilitate this and ensure that the historically significant material is not affected.
- 18 The most significant alterations to the listed buildings that are proposed by this development include the insertion of a new lift in 133 Camberwell Road and the removal of a primary staircase in 135 Camberwell Road as well as the removal of a number of secondary staircases in numbers 135, 137 and 139 Camberwell Road.

- 19 The new lift is proposed in order to bring the entire complex up to the current Disability Discrimination Act standards and to offer access for wheel-chair users to all floors. Whilst this Act states that organisations must make the 'reasonable' adjustments necessary, this scheme is predicated by Cambridge House's ambition to accommodate a range of voluntary organisations including those that support people with disabilities and as such it is reasonable to expect that every part of the new development can be reached. In relation to the Disability Discrimination Act PPS 5 – Planning for the Historic Environment; Historic Environment Planning Practice Guide (March 2010 – paragraph 144) states that: *'Sometimes the best means of conserving a heritage asset will seem to conflict with the requirements of such regimes. Local planning authorities are encouraged to consider imaginative ways of avoiding such conflict. Where conflict is unavoidable, such regimes generally allow for some flexibility so that a balance can be struck.'*
- 20 The new lift is located to the rear of number 133 Camberwell Road which has been substantially remodelled. Evidence submitted with the application suggests that an original curved bay has been removed in this location at one point in its history and the entire rear wall of number 133 Camberwell Road rebuilt approximately 1.5 outside the original line of the back wall of this house. In terms of its location on plan the sensitive insertion of a lift can be supported in this location because the affected floor is already much altered and evidently not original, however the scale of the lift and, most notably, its protrusion from the roof is considered excessive. A condition such as that noted above could limit the visual prominence of this feature but will not remove the harmful impact of this proposal on the fabric and the historic significance of this listed building as a result of the loss of existing roof structure caused by the lift extending through this part of the attic.
- 21 The loss of a number of original staircases has been the subject of detailed discussions with officers and with English Heritage. These features are important contributors to the historic significance of these listed buildings and ensure that the plan-form retains its distinctive arrangement of a Georgian terrace with a principle room across the front and a secondary room to the rear flanked by the stair. The loss of these staircases has been justified in the application material by the benefit offered to Cambridge House by the rationalisation of the plan form which creates more usable space on every floor – at the expense of the historic features – and allows for the insertion of a new and more accessible stair that will comply with current standards. The proposed new stair will be the new principle staircase for Cambridge House and is located in the area of the original stair of 135 Camberwell Road – though turned through 90 degrees to allow for the increased length and width of a modern stair. Its detailed design is important therefore and, as a primary stair, it could and should be of exemplary quality. One way of securing the exemplary quality of its design would be to make its detailed design a reserved matter to ensure that the stair is light and elegant, and of exceptional quality.
- 22 The Georgian Group have objected to both the insertion of the lift at 133 Camberwell Road and the loss the staircase in 135 Camberwell Road. The Georgian Group is one of the six Amenity Societies listed by the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (the Act). Under Section 13 of the Act the Council is unable to determine this application and must refer their decision to the Secretary of State for determination. Under the Act a proposal to demolish any principal internal element of the structure including any staircase, load-bearing wall, floor structure or roof structure shall be treated as a proposal for the demolition of a substantial part of the interior.
- 23 When the scheme was presented to the Councils' Design Review Panel on February 8 2010 the Panel was not convinced by the proposed loss of historic fabric in key elements of the building plans as a result of the insertion of a new lift and a new stair. Whilst they welcomed the improvements to the listed buildings including the removal of unsympathetic accretions over the years and the restoration of important historic

features, they were concerned about the loss of a chimney breast and historic stair on all floors at 133/5 Camberwell Road. They encouraged the architects to review their proposals in detail and to see if more of the original historic fabric could be retained. Only minor amendments were made to the scheme as a result of these comments.

- 24 In summary, these proposals appear to challenge the requirements of policy 3.17 and those of PPS5 Planning for the Historic Environment but offer significant wider public benefits both through the on-going presence of Cambridge House on this site and the preservation of the features that remain. English Heritage have stated that they do not intend to object to this scheme and have placed significant weight on the positive contribution that Cambridge House as an organisation have made to this group of historic buildings through their on-going presence on the site. This is not only through their provision of a viable use for these historic buildings but also the long term conservation benefits of this scheme which have arisen out of Cambridge House's continuous presence on this site for over 100 years. English Heritage note that the history of these buildings is inherently linked to this organisation which has occupied this site long before these buildings were listed and have suggested that the on-going presence of this Cambridge House on this site can be considered to be a part of the significance of this group of buildings.
- 25 Policy 3.18 asserts that permission will not be granted for developments that would not preserve or enhance: the immediate or wider setting of a listed building; or important views of a listed building; or the setting of the Conservation Area; or views into or out of a Conservation Area.
- 26 The new circulation core to the site remains below the parapets of the existing 2-storey building on Addington Square and therefore the views in and around the conservation area are preserved. The only presence of the scheme from Addington Square is the lift overrun which will appear over the parapet at the rear of 133 Camberwell Road. The box-shaped form of the lift overrun is proposed to remain below the ridge-line of the mansarded roof of the listed buildings and will therefore be not visible from Camberwell Road or other more distant views into the Conservation Area. Its design is unashamedly modern but finished in an appropriate metal facing that will weather suitably in time. In this way it does not try to be a part of the roof but a complimentary and appropriate part of the history of the site.
- 27 If the lift overrun were to extend over the top of the ridge of the mansard roof of 133 Camberwell Road this would be an incongruous element that would have a harmful impact on the conservation area particularly as it will be visible in the distant views from Camberwell Road and the elevated railway line to the west. A height limitation could be imposed by way of a condition to ensure that the lift overrun does not exceed the height of the ridge of 133 Camberwell Road.
- 28 The setting of the conservation area will be enhanced by the landscape works to the front gardens and the works to the flank of the Victorian Hall on Addington Square which will seek to remove recent unsympathetic adaptations and extensions and reinstate landscaped areas and lawned gardens leading to the front doors. As such this proposal preserves and enhances views of the listed buildings and those into and out of the conservation area.
- 29 The recently published PPS 5 states in Policy HE9.4 that "where a proposal has a harmful impact on the significance of a designated heritage asset which is less than substantial harm in all cases local planning authorities should:
(i) Weigh the public benefit of the proposal against the harm; and
(ii) Recognise that the greater the harm to the significance of the heritage asset the greater the justification will be needed for any loss."
- 30 It is considered that a case can be made here therefore for the substantial wider public benefits that will be gained by this scheme as well as the benefits to the

heritage asset of the on-going presence of Cambridge House on this site which acquired these buildings of national importance long before they were listed and is seeking to secure their on-going viable occupation for the foreseeable future. The harm certainly falls within the definition set out in Policy HE9.4 and the new PPS5 offers clear guidance in these cases.

- 31 Overall, therefore, the scheme is considered to be acceptable having had regard to policies 3.17 Listed buildings and 3.18 Setting of listed buildings, conservation areas and world heritage sites of the Southwark Plan 2007, and the guidance contained within PPS5 Planning and the Historic Environment.

Impact on trees

- 32 Not material to this application for listed building consent.

Planning obligations (S.106 undertaking or agreement)

- 33 None relevant to this application.

Sustainable development implications

- 34 None.

Other matters

- 35 None.

Conclusion on planning issues

- 36 The scheme was considered in relation to the impact on the special historic and architectural interest of the listed buildings and the setting of the surrounding listed buildings. Regard was had to objections that were raised to the effects of the scheme on the listed building, where it is recognised that there would be some harm arising to the fabric of the buildings but it is considered that a case can be made here for the substantial wider public benefits that will be gained by this scheme as well as the benefits to the heritage asset of the on-going presence of Cambridge House on this site which acquired these buildings of national importance long before they were listed and is seeking to secure their on-going viable occupation for the foreseeable future. Conditions are considered appropriate to mitigate particular impacts of the scheme in relation to design quality. It is therefore recommended that listed building consent be granted having regard to the policies considered and other material planning considerations.

Community impact statement

- 37 In line with the Council's Community Impact Statement the impact of this application has been assessed as part of the application process with regard to local people in respect of their age, disability, faith/religion, gender, race and ethnicity and sexual orientation. Consultation with the community has been undertaken as part of the application process.

a) The impact on local people is set out above.

b) The following issues relevant to particular communities/groups likely to be affected by the proposal have been identified as: none

c) The likely adverse or less good implications for any particular communities/groups have been also been discussed above. Specific actions to ameliorate these implications are: none required

Consultations

- 38 Details of consultation and any re-consultation undertaken in respect of this application are set out in Appendix 1.

Consultation replies

- 39 Details of consultation responses received are set out in Appendix 2.

Summary of consultation responses

Refer to accompanying report on application for full planning permission LBS Reg 10AP0415.

Human rights implications

- 40 This planning application engages certain human rights under the Human Rights Act 2008 (the HRA). The HRA prohibits unlawful interference by public bodies with conventions rights. The term 'engage' simply means that human rights may be affected or relevant.
- 41 This application has the legitimate aim of providing for alterations to a group of listed buildings in connection with their continued and extended use for community support purposes. The rights potentially engaged by this application, including the right to a fair trial and the right to respect for private and family life are not considered to be unlawfully interfered with by this proposal.

SUPPLEMENTARY ADVICE FROM OTHER OFFICERS

Strategic Director of Communities, Law & Governance

REASONS FOR LATENESS

REASONS FOR URGENCY

BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS

Background Papers	Held At	Contact
Site history file: TP/2064-131 Application file: 10-AP-0419 Southwark Local Development Framework and Development Plan Documents	Regeneration and Neighbourhoods Department 160 Tooley Street London SE1 2TZ	Planning enquiries telephone: 020 7525 5403 Planning enquiries email: planning.enquiries@southwark.gov.uk Case officer telephone:: 020 7525 1137 Council website: www.southwark.gov.uk

APPENDICES

No.	Title
Appendix 1	Consultation undertaken
Appendix 2	Consultation responses received

AUDIT TRAIL

Lead Officer		
Report Author	Becky Baker	
Version		
Dated		
Key Decision		
CONSULTATION WITH OTHER OFFICERS / DIRECTORATES / EXECUTIVE MEMBER		
Officer Title	Comments Sought	Comments included
Strategic Director of Communities, Law & Governance		
Strategic Director of Regeneration and Neighbourhoods		
Strategic Director of Environment and Housing		
Date final report sent to Constitutional / Community Council / Scrutiny Team		

APPENDIX 1

Consultation undertaken

Site notice date: 04/03/2010

Press notice date: 4/3/2010

Case officer site visit date: 4/3/2010 (unaccompanied) and 24/3/2010 (accompanied by applicant and agent)

Neighbour consultation letters sent: 2/3/2010

Internal services consulted:

Design and conservation

Statutory and non-statutory organisations consulted:

The Camberwell Society

Cadre Architects

Castle Point Insulation Limited, Ross House, Unit 9, Crittall Road

c/o The Camberwell Society

Conservation Areas Advisory Group

Ancient Monuments Society

Council for British Archaeology

English Heritage

Gerridge Court Residents Association

The Georgian Group

The Victorian Society

Neighbours and local groups consulted:

Refer to accompanying report on application for full planning permission LBS Reg 10AP0415.

Re-consultation:

None

APPENDIX 2

Consultation responses received

Internal services

Refer to accompanying report on application for full planning permission LBS Reg 10AP0415.

Statutory and non-statutory organisations

Refer to accompanying report on application for full planning permission LBS Reg 10AP0415.

Neighbours and local groups

Refer to accompanying report on application for full planning permission LBS Reg 10AP0415.